Queer is in the Eye of the Newcomer: Mapping, Performance & Place Based Media

Liz Miller
Concordia University (Communications Studies)

Abstract
This article describes two collaborative media projects that work with groups of LGBTQ or queer youth with refugee experience in Toronto to explore alternative representations to the victimization they must perform in order to obtain refugee status. Canada has traditionally maintained a progressive interpretation of the UN Refugee Convention permitting individuals who are exposed to violence based on their sexual preference/identity to apply for asylum. At the same time the state works with essentialized Western notions of gay identity and the act of proving oneself often becomes a humiliating process. The objectives of the collaborative media projects are to challenge past performances of victimization, to help the youth involved articulate their identity in a new place, and to explore the advocacy potential in taking their personal stories public.

Introduction

There were eight of us around the table listening to Omar describe his ambivalence about performing victimization as a queer refugee to the border official, his lawyer, and the Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada: “You have to explain everything right to ensure getting status and you have to frame yourself as a victim.” Samantha then shared her arrival
story and experience dealing with a border official who she identified as a Muslim and imagined would have discriminated against her if she had revealed her queer identity and reasons for coming to Toronto. While the group challenged Samantha on her assumption that all Muslims are homophobic, we acknowledged the power imbalance in the interaction between a border official and an individual applying for asylum. The group conferred that airport harassment by officials around sexual orientation or gender identity was common and, as Samantha asserted, “in that moment your life is in someone else’s hands.”

[2] This group came together because of their shared experience of being forced to leave their families, homes, and countries including Mexico, Turkey, and Pakistan as a result of persecution based on sexual orientation. Our conversations were part of a media workshop and the youth involved were active members of Express, a support group welcoming refugees, refugee claimants, and non-status queer and trans youth in Toronto. The Express group meets on a weekly basis and involves at least fifteen participants who come together to resolve pressing concerns, like finding a job, house, or lawyer. Participants return each week largely because of the friendships and networks they develop within the group and also because of the safe space the project facilitator Suhail AbualSameed has cultivated over time. The weekend media workshop was the result of a new collaboration.
between Express and Mapping Memories, a collaborative multi-media research-creation project that explores place based participatory media practice and its potential to help individuals with refugee experience\textsuperscript{vii} to establish themselves in a new environment.\textsuperscript{viii}

[3] While participatory media has become a bit of a catch all phrase for text, videos, and audio that circulate on the Internet and that challenge clear cut divisions between audience and creators, I use the term to describe a process that permits individuals to frame their own stories. In this respect, participants who are often misrepresented in mainstream media have a chance to learn new skills and to construct their narratives. Regardless of the technology utilized (still cameras, video, audio, Do It Yourself—DIY—mapping technologies) a collaborative creative process can also provide an opportunity for individuals to reflect on the relationship of their personal narratives to larger social concerns. Clemencia Rodriguez in her vision of citizens’ media articulates how collaborative media projects can influence both identity construction as well as positions of power or personal agency: “Alternative media spin transformative processes that alter people’s sense of self, their subjective positionings, and therefore their access to power” (Rodriguez 2001, 18).

[4] For this particular workshop our emphasis was to explore getting past
narratives of victimization to more complex expressions of self. Personal narratives, much like identity, are constructed, relational, contextual, and always changing and media provides a creative opportunity to explore these aspect of our selves. The workshop was intended to engage in what Stuart Hall calls processes of identity construction (Hall in Shohat and Stam 358) through conversations, writing exercises, still photo shoots, and ultimately a public presentation of the work. The workshop involved five participants and three facilitators including Express coordinator Suhail AbualSameed, documentary maker Martha Stiegman, and myself, also a documentary maker. Suhail did the recruitment and selected new arrivals as well as individuals who had been in Toronto for some time. While our group was small, our interaction was essential and we considered the process as important as any desired final product. At the same time, we hoped the final work would be useful for future newcomers or even for decision makers dealing with refugee claimants persecuted based on sexual orientation.

[5] Guiding our creative process was a series of questions including: how do narratives of victimization mark us? What is difference between a victim and a survivor? How can we address stereotypes regarding queers and youth with refugee experience? In addition to a meaningful process, participatory media projects can also impact audiences and be used for advocacy or education. Because of the sensitive nature of this group and the fact that
several participants were still in the process of applying as refugee claimants, taking media work public invited additional questions such as: how much of my story do I want to share with a larger public? Could there be any negative repercussions? Who needs to hear these stories?

[6] I personally do not identify as a queer refugee, but I immigrated to Canada six years ago and have admired Canada’s position in providing a safe haven for those persecuted for their sexual orientation. More recently however, the Canadian government has introduced reforms that would impact individuals making claims based on sexual orientation and reduced the numbers of refugees permitted into Canada. This represents a major set back given the horrors of escalating anti-gay backlash in countries like Malawi, Uganda, and Iraq. By describing the process of two creative projects that emphasize personal narrative and place, this article addresses the challenges in helping individuals with sensitive stories turn past personal experiences into public stories. In both of the workshops making media was a catalyst for public interventions to reframe victim narratives and ultimately sensitise the general public to the obscurity of human rights and asylum protection for Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer (LGBTQ) individuals.
Can You Prove That You Are Gay?

The purpose of the workshops was to create a safe space for participants to reflect on the process of getting established in a new city, but an extra perk was that participants who were still making their refugee claims could use these workshops as “evidence” that they were indeed queer. Providing evidence is one of the most challenging aspects of the application process because members of the Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada receive little or no sensitivity training in handling LGBTQ refugee claimants. Individuals must perform a queer identity in a way that can be immediately understood by the individual judging the case. Experienced immigrant lawyers advise clients to “dress for the occasion” as refugee board members have been known to inquire, “But you don’t look gay, how can you prove it?” Implicit in this request are Western assumptions of “gay” identity and expectations of being “out.” Many individuals don’t identify with the stereotyped roles they are expected to perform, furthermore, providing an official with the performance he/she is expecting is complicated for those individuals who have spent years hiding their queer identity or have been forced to perform hetero-normative roles for fear of persecution. Heightened anxiety and misunderstanding can be reinforced by cultural and language barriers or a homophobic lawyer or translator. One very practical bit of advice that Express coordinator Suhail offers to his youth group is to be careful of burning bridges with past lovers given that claimants are also
expected to provide proof of sexual intercourse via photos or letters with someone of the same sex. While it is problematic to reduce identity politics to sexual practices it is also humiliating for many individuals who are grappling with shame and fear connected to their sexual preferences. In this respect, the Express group becomes an invaluable space for individuals to share experiences and exchange advice in preparation for their hearings.

**If I Only Knew**

Creating a space to reflect on complex negotiations of identity was a critical part of the workshop. We decided to address the tension between what is expressed to a border official, lawyer or board member and other more personal expressions of self through a creative exercise. The exercise was to “queer” or transform the Personal Identification Form (PIF) that every refugee claimant fills out upon entering the country. We used the form as an aesthetic parameter as well as a stage to construct and explore new narratives – narratives that are not solicited by an immigration officer including artistic influences, personal memories, or even personal contradictions. The objective of the exercise was to challenge the
official victim narratives performed and inscribed through the refugee application process. The PIFs were used as biographical notes for the final show that featured the 11 x 17 panels produced in the workshop.

[9] Difficult decisions, lack of choice, and being at a crossroads in life were some of the themes that emerged in the texts and images created in the workshop. The trauma of leaving things behind such as personal property, loved ones, family members, even identification cards is common to the refugee experience; we asked participants to write about an object they had brought with them or alternatively something they had left behind. After two weekends of production we spent a month preparing for a public exhibition and Suhail installed the finished work at City Hall in Toronto on the occasion of International Refugee Day. The title of our show If I Only Knew communicated the participants’ motivations to share what they had learned throughout their own immigration process with future newcomers or decisions makers. If I Only Knew marked one of the first times sexual orientation issues were brought into the spotlight at a refugee forum like this in Toronto and the show was covered by the media and seen by employees.
of settlement agencies, faith based groups, public officials and employees of City Hall. Erasmo, one of the youth participants who presented at the event, was energized by the positive response:

“I had the opportunity to talk about the exhibition and to talk in the city hall to over 100 people – they could see what is in our hearts and our lives” (Video Interview, 2007).\textsuperscript{xv}

Following the City Hall exhibit the work was displayed at the Sherbourne Health Center and then traveled to additional events sponsored by diverse LGBTA organizations in Toronto and throughout Canada. As a result of the enthusiastic reception of the work the youth were awarded the prestigious Youth Line Award for their “unique contributions to fostering community.”\textsuperscript{xvi}

[10] In evaluating our first workshop, it was obvious to me that the success of \textit{If I Only Knew} was largely due to Express Coordinator, Suhail’s investment in the project. He was involved in the planning, production design, and ultimately the critical stage of disseminating the finished work. The trust established between the participants is a result of the ongoing intimacy he cultivates with his support group. Suhail viewed the workshops as a natural extension of his ongoing work explaining that the smaller size of
the Mapping Memory workshop provided a chance for participants to delve deeper into more intimate issues. The workshop presented an opportunity for Suhail and his group to make an impact in the public realm and temporarily shift gears from direct service work to advocacy.

[11] During the process of creation and interactions with engaged publics personal narratives were significantly reframed. One of the participants Omar described his experience of the public presentations:

> It was a chance to communicate it differently than I have been doing for the past five years. You go to a conference you talk about I am a refugee—it is the same story—people have heard it—I am the victim—this was different—in this I was saying this is me, this is how I feel about certain things—I don’t have to justify why I feel these things and I am doing it in a more creative way ...it’s a poem and you can take whatever you want from it.

(Interview, 2007)xvii

Omar’s reflection speaks to a tension many youth with refugee experience face. They want to process difficult experiences and share their story with a larger audience but they also want to get beyond a narrative that essentializes their notion of self.
**Queer is the Eye of the Newcomer**

Based on the success of our first project, Martha, Suhail and I were eager to collaborate again. This time we wanted to incorporate some of the place based media methods (like DIY cartography) that we were exploring with other Mapping Memories projects. Express had initiated a new collaboration with Jane’s Walk Toronto; a group that facilitates volunteer based guided tours of neighborhoods throughout Canada. The walking tours are a tribute to and a continuation of the work spearheaded by urban geographer Jane Jacobs to make cities walkable and ensure citizen involvement in urban planning. The tours bring people together across 65 cities worldwide (35 in Canada, 25 in the USA) to discuss the culture, history, and contemporary politics of neighborhoods. Jane’s Walk had planned 74 walks throughout Toronto for 2009 and for the first time they wanted to ensure the involvement of youth. After several weeks of meetings with Jane’s Walk facilitator Jeb Kilbourn, four Express participants had mapped their stories to five sites and were ready to lead a tour of their Toronto which they called *Queer is in the Eye of the Newcomer*. On a Jane’s Walk a street corner or a café holds as much significance as an official monument or park; the unique walk developed by the Express participants revealed their subjective take on an area known as the Church Wellesley

*InTensions Journal*
Copyright ©2010 by York University (Toronto, Canada)
Issue 4 (Fall 2010) ISSN# 1913-5874
Village. Nate, one of the tour guides, explained how the group decided to integrate their own narratives into the tour.

“When we started off we were planning on doing a tour of this gay village but then we thought about what it meant for us as newcomers in different spots.” (Interview, May 2009)

[13] The role of Mapping Memories would be to extend the project beyond the physical walk and work with the group to create an on-line version of the walk. The idea was to broaden the reach of the project, motivate others to get involved, and explore how mapping a story on-line could contribute to the live performance of the walk. To do this, we filmed the performances the day before the walk and then on the day of the actual tour.

[14] The first location on the tour was the Sherbourne Health Center where the Express group meets each week. Here the guides introduced themselves and shared their first impressions of Express. The stories were playful and the guides contrasted the rather dull appearance of the health center with the dynamic interaction that takes place inside. The second stop on the tour was deemed “the goodbye corner” where Express members part each week after the support group. Making use of functional as well as symbolic mapping, the group shared their personal goodbye stories as well—the circumstances under which they were forced to leave their home countries
without proper goodbyes. Their stories were received with warm smiles, empathetic nods and enthusiastic applause. One guide proudly explained, “when I arrived six months ago, I could hardly speak English, and here I am today leading you on a tour of this neighborhood.” The third stop of the tour was the Food Court where participants meet after the official support group to discuss personal issues and swap practical advice such as how to get an additional ID card to avoid being recognized as a refugee. Love, sex, and whether to get involved with other support group members are the most common topics worked out over meals at the Food Court. The fourth stop on the tour was Buddies Theatre, a queer venue that offers an open mike night for new talent. Here visitors on the walking tour were treated to a live singing performance by one of the tour guides. Having sang professionally in his home country, the guide explained how important the theatre had been as he struggled to find his way in a new place. The walking tour ended on Church St., the center of one of Toronto’s largest LGBTQ neighborhoods where the guides shared their first impressions of the area. They shared their favorite bars as well as candid descriptions of feeling objectification, discrimination and alienation. The guides shared the respective challenges they had experienced in finding safe meeting places for queer groups in their own countries.

**Place Based Stories**
Geography was a catalyst in the construction of the tour narratives as well as the live performance. Sound walk practitioner and scholar Tony Butler has written about the diverse ways artists, oral historians, and cultural geographers have used place to shape narratives. Concepts of place, he explains, are key to understanding the intersection of memory, personal histories, and sound walks. Butler references the work of Edward Relph who argues that a fundamental aspect of being human is to live in a world that is filled with significant places because place determines our experience (Relph 1976). “Place, home and ‘roots’ are a fundamental human need and they shape our cultural identity,” writes Butler (Butler 2001,366). A radical dislocation from familiar places was a shared experience of this group; the tour was able to facilitate a way to bring their collective pasts and contemporary experiences together around new public places the group had in common. The skill with which the youth forged comparisons between the cultures they left and the cultures they were encountering were of interest to the public and also a means for the group to reflect on their relocation. In some cases the tension between the personal nature of their stories and the public location was unnerving. *The Goodbye Corner* was a series of stories about leaving their respective countries that were quite intimate while performed on one of the busiest street corners in Toronto. Gabriel, for example, initially a shy participant recounted the abuse he experienced in St. Vincent at a busy intersection in Toronto. While filming his performance I
was aware of his vulnerability—his voice and his story competing with a noisy urban soundscape. And yet, as he spoke to us, I also observed a transformation from personal secret to public record, from shy individual to more confident communicator. Observing the supportive group around him, I wondered how differently Gabe might have narrated his story to a journalist or in a circumstance outside of this collaborative framework. It was not simply the place or the public performance but also the collective endeavor that impacted both the story and the telling of the story.

**On Mapping**

The Tactical Technology Collective in their resource “Maps for Advocacy” explains how maps help represent links between places, events, facts, and help to visualize communities. The editors of *Rethinking Maps: New Frontiers in Cartographic Theory* trace the history of cartographic theory/praxis and explore how advances in technology have led to both a democratization of cartographic practice and a mapping renaissance.

New mapping technologies have gained the attention of industry, government and to some extent the general public keen to capitalize on the growing power, richness and flexibility of maps as organizational tools, modes of analysis and, above all, compelling visual images with rhetorical power. (Kitchen, Perkins, Dodge 2009,2)
[17] As a documentary maker I have been following new trends in connecting personal narratives to data visualization projects. Iron Curtain Diaries, Never Coming Home, and Gaza-Sderot: Life in Spite of Everything are excellent examples of spatial narratives. By spatial narratives I am suggesting that the markers on a map relay a story in itself, a story made more powerful when connected to personal narratives. For example, in Never Coming Home the artists have created a collective portrait of the impact of American casualties in Iraq by mapping the location where an individual died and then connecting this marker to a short narrative of an individual grieving the loss of this person.

[18] With a much-reduced budget we explored two platforms and forms of mapping the tour stories. The first approach was to prioritize geography and visualization by mapping the video clips to locations on the walk using Google map and our web platform Drupal (an open source content management system). What distinguished this platform from the actual walk was the lack of a clear beginning or end and the ability to gain a bird’s eye view of both the walk and the neighborhood. The second approach was to map the narratives based on theme and association.
and to permit a degree of interactivity for the user. To do this we used the Korsakow System, a software application for creating “database narratives.”

This form of storytelling permitted the user or audience to determine the path of the narrative based on data organized by a character or theme. Korsakow is the invention of Florian Thalhofer and was developed into a free Internet download with the support and assistance of—a research group on interactive narrative experimentation at Concordia called ciner-g.

[19] Once the stories were mapped online, I invited the Toronto youth guides to Montreal to launch the on-line tour and share the experience at an event organized by Ethnoculture, a group that brings together queer minorities in Montreal. The combination of the on-ground walking tour with the on-line tour had facilitated a new engagement with place for the participants. Felipe, one of the youth guides, explained to the Montreal audience:

I realized it is a great thing for youth not just to share your stories but to listen to what you just shared ... before the project I would tell everyone what I thought but after watching the video, watching me tell my own story I felt like that was true ... once I saw myself at the gay neighborhood talking about my stories and how they relate to being gay in Toronto then I felt ok—that it is also my space—I am going there and I am
changing it and I am making myself included in this gay community in Toronto ... So having this project was a great way of me seeing how I could fit into this new society. (Video Documentation, 2009)

The video production and mapping were not simply a means to move across platforms or to archive and share these stories with a larger audience; the process worked as reflective surface providing an opportunity for the participants to further consider their place in the community. Another participant Gabe explained:

Taking part of this project was amazing. I have never been out—this project brought me out—I am shy but I realized I could do something with the voice I have inside. I am gay but I can make a difference—to help people who are there without the support. We want see if the people of Montreal would like to build from something we are doing—we are trying to see if we can get youth involved. (Video Documentation, 2009)

For Gabe the experience was an opportunity to come out not simply as a gay man but as a leader eager to involve others.
**Media Representations & Live Performances**

Having experienced both walks I noted the differences between them as well as their complementary roles. In the live version the stories came together as one narrative and the group dynamic was reinforced. The walk also offered the guides immediate affirmation from the crowd. The filmed performances permitted a more intimate space and a chance to rehearse. Observing the guides as I filmed, I reflected on the act of rehearsing within a documentary project and the tension between being prepared versus maintaining a space for spontaneity. Performing the stories for the camera was certainly a helpful step in preparing for the “live” walk. Much like a theatre performance—with each take the group gained more control over the narrative they planned to share. As a filmmaker it is common to work with individuals who have a constructed narrative of a past event or memory. This is especially true for those who spend time in the media spotlight; for them the challenge is about getting past an over-scripted presentation which may not resonate with a larger audience. In most documentary circumstances rehearsal is not only unnecessary but is ineffective. For this project, however, the process was more important than the final product. Rehearsing the story fostered confidence in feeling a sense of control about taking a personal story to an anonymous public audience.

[21] Another difference between the two walks was that the on-line walk...
was not limited to a local audience and there were risks to explore as a result of this engagement with an even larger unknown audience. As a group we discussed possible negative ramifications before filming or uploading any content on-line. I emphasized to participants that the circulation of media is unpredictable. If media is circulated, especially via the Internet, then it should be assumed that an oppressor or an opponent would see it. xxix *Queer is in the Eye of the Newcomer* did involve a challenging negotiation with one of the tour guides who wanted to be involved but was worried about exposing his identity on the Internet: he did not want his father to see the video and discover his whereabouts. Nor did he want his first video representation to be a blurred or obscured record of self particularly since he had already lived with so much secrecy. As a result, the video was shot without using any techniques to hide his identity. Instead we found a way to protect his identity in the editing room by adding a soft blur to his face, a technique that we could undo at a later date. The experience shed light on the need to pay careful attention to the circumstances of each individual. It also illustrated the tension between a media device that captures a moment in time and the negotiation of identity which is always in flux. A year later this same tour guide was asked to become a *Jane’s Walk* employee and has since facilitated a second walk along with a new Express group. He moved from a participant to a facilitator and the video project played a role in the crystallization of how his story could inspire others in similar circumstances.
It was important for him to understand his options and carefully weigh how to balance the work of inspiring others with the need to protect himself.

**Beyond a fixed destination or narrative**

In describing collaborative endeavors Oral historian Michael Frisch discusses the process by explaining: “A commitment to sharing authority is a beginning, not a destination. There are no easy answers or formulas and no simple lessons.” (Frisch 2003, 111) Likewise there are no simple means to evaluate the success of a collaborative youth media project in its ability to impact the youth involved and the potential audiences. The unique intersection of media and performance in both projects permitted a process that shifted one dimensional fixed victim narratives into multi-platform, multi-dimensional narratives. While indeed, media can only capture a moment in time, the process served as a powerful tool for both self and group reflection. Once recorded, the stories were able to travel independently, freeing the participants from an obligation to perform their stories again and again. While the “live” walking tour and the public presentations were ephemeral, the direct engagement with audiences was affirming and helped participants understand how their stories could touch others and make a difference. What these projects demonstrate is that collaborative media projects can play a small part in alleviating the tension between the public’s need to understand the unique challenges faced by
queer youth in Canada and the need for these youth to get past confining narratives of victimization.

---

i Some names have been changed to protect identities.
ii I will use the term queer as shorthand throughout the article to refer to gay, lesbian, bisexual, transgender, intersex and non-normative heterosexual individuals. The term “queer” is frequently used by the youth attending the “Express” program for non-status queer and trans youth. The term queer often refers to an ambiguity of both gender identity and sexual orientation.
iii Under the Geneva Convention Protocol of 1967, the term ‘refugee’ refers to individuals from another country who are offered protection based upon a fear of persecution because of their race, religion, nationality, membership to a social group, or political opinion, and who are unable or unwilling to return to his/her country of origin.
iv Sexual orientation refers to emotional, romantic, and/or sexual attractions to men, women, or both sexes. These attractions contribute to an individual’s personal and social identity.
v An individual’s subjective sense of self as male, female, or trans-identified.
vi The group is part of “Supporting Our Youth” serving lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, and transsexual youth in Toronto.
vii I use the term refugee experience to broaden the narrow spectrum of who is officially deemed a refugee. Individuals applying for status, family members of a refugee claimant, a loved are all impacted by the “refugee experience.”
viii This SSHRC funded project combines participatory and advocacy media methods to explore how digital media tools such as DIY Cartography (Do it Yourself) combined with personal narratives can help to deepen an understanding of the under represented refugee youth experience. http://storytelling.concordia.ca/refugeeyouth/
ix The Canadian Council for Refugees report that a rising number of claimants will be shut out of Canada because of changes in the determination system and new visa requirements. The government has announced that of new permanent residents in 2010, only 8% will be refugees. This is the lowest proportion given to refugees in at least 20 years (down from an average of 12% in the past two decades). http://ccrweb.ca/en/concerns2009, Accessed March 14, 2010.
x Bill C-11 was one such reform that if it had passed would have prohibited individuals coming from “safe countries” to have access to a refugee appeal. http://www.ccrweb.ca/
xi “Malawi launches operation against high-profile gay and lesbian people.”, 2/16/10, guardian.co.uk, Accessed March 14, 2010.
xii “Gay activists attack Ugandan preacher’s porn slideshow,” 2/18/10, guardian.co.uk, Accessed March 14, 2010.
xiv Sharlyn Jordan in her PHD, “Un/Settling: A Critical Ethnograph of QLGBT refugee migration and settlement in Vancouver” offers concrete suggestions of this theme. Another critical resource in this area is “Speak Out: Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans and Queer Refugees in Canada: Exploring Intersections of Sexual, Gender, and Cultural Diversity” by Shari Brotman and Ou Jin Edward Lee
 xv Video Interview conducted by Michele Luch of the Ministry of Education and shot by Liz Miller, Sept. 2007.
xvi Youth Line award recognize “the outstanding contributions of lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, transsexual, two-spirit and queer youth and youth services that are making a
difference throughout the province of Ontario.


Video Interview conducted by Michele Luchs of the Ministry of Education and shot by Liz Miller, Sept. 2007.


Jeb is a master student in Urban Planning at York with past experience working in immigrant and queer communities.

Video documentation shot by Martha Stiegman, May 2009.


Steve Anderson explores database narratives in a constructed conversation with new media scholars Lev Manovich and Marsha Kinder


For over 10 years I have collaborated with Witness, a non-profit that trains human rights groups to integrate video into ongoing advocacy campaigns. Sam Gregory, Program Director of Witness in particular has informed my practices around consent and new media.


Works Cited


Rheingold, Howard. “Using Participatory Media and Public Voice to Encourage Civic Engagement.” In Civic Life Online: Learning How Digital Media

InTensions Journal
Copyright ©2010 by York University (Toronto, Canada)
Issue 4 (Fall 2010) ISSN# 1913-5874

